International Journal of Applied Sociology 2014, 4(1): 30-33
DOI: 10.5923/j.ijas.20140401.04

Obstacles of Policy Implementation of Street Vendors Arrangement in Makassar, South Sulawesi, Indonesia

Muhammad Nur*, Abdul Yuli Andi Gani, M. Saleh Soeaidy

[1]Public Administration Department, Faculty of Administrative Science, Brawijaya University, Indonesia

Abstract One of problems was faced by Makassar city is the street vendors' problem. The street vendors' problem was classical problem that up to now faced by the government of Makassar city. Various regulations relate with the street vendors arrangement at the Makassar city has been issued since the Local Regulation No 10 Year 1990 on Development of Street Vendors then be followed by various Mayor Regulations relate with the arrangement and restructuring of street vendors seem not run as expected, it can not be denied that the policy implementation that did not run well by the Makassar's Government about street vendors that impact to the restructuring of street vendors caused by the resistant attitude of the street vendors themselves. The restructuring of street vendors at the Makassar city become interminable pattern, because of that it needs comprehensive solution to the street vendors' problems in Makassar city by investigating first the obstacles in the policy implementation of the street vendor arrangement at the Makassar city. The research used descriptive qualitative method and data collection by using interview, observation and documentation. The results showed that description and analysis about the obstacles at the Makassar city came from the policy itself where the existing policy unable to disentangle the street vendors' problems. The policy substance was not relevant with the complexity of street vendors' handling at the Makassar. It needs policy that able to give comprehensive solution to the street vendor problems especially the solution to the street vendors' existence at the Makassar city.

Keywords Obstacles of policy implementation, Arrangement and restructuring, Street vendors at the Makassar city

1. Introduction

Street vendors become one of business alternative in the informal sector whose the existence because limited work opportunities in the crowded cities including at the Makassar city. The existence of the street vendors in the cities always brings problems for cleanliness and beautifulness of the city. Street vendors often do their business at the allotted areas such as City Park, street, sidewalk, shop overhang, and other public facilities. It causes bigger problems such as city chaos, rubbish, traffic jam, and etc.

But it can not be denied that the role of street vendors able to give significant contribution to the local and national economic growth. That's way each city government had to develop the street vendors in the form of guidance to improve the business capital, assurance of business protection and business skill so the street vendors are aided an protected as regulated in the policy of the Development of the Small and Medium Enterprise (UKM), and beside that, it needs policy to arrange the street vendors well, keep their existence, and still give contribution to the society economic income without bring urban problems such as disturb the road user, slum and dirty city scene.

Based on the collected data from Civil Service Police Unit (Satpol PP) in Makassar City that the street vendors at the Makassar city of 10 thousands.While the obtained data through the Head of Industrial and Commerce Agency of Makassar City, according to him, there is no valid data about the amount of street vendors, but from data of 14 districts in Makassar, the street vendors in Makassar at about 14 thousands [1].

By realizing the role of street vendors' existence in giving contribution to the economy and the creation of work opportunities and also will impact to the emerged problems because of street vendors in Makassar city, the Makassar city government has issued Local Regulation No 10 year 1990 on Development of Street Vendor at the Makassar city, where in the local regulation also regulate about the business location and the City government of Makassar has issued some Mayor Regulations that related with the street vendors' arrangement where it is stated there is prohibition at some road to the street vendors to do their business. While the regulation is Mayor Regulation No 44 Year 2002 on Designation of Some Yards For and Not For Street Vendors at the Makassar city and the Mayor Decree No 651 Year 2007 on Rectangle Area of Road as the Pilot Project of Cleanliness and Regulation Enforcement of Makassar City.

* Corresponding author:
ilovepare2@gmail.com (Muhammad Nur)
Published online at http://journal.sapub.org/ijas
Copyright © 2014 Scientific & Academic Publishing. All Rights Reserved

The policy of Makassar city in regulate the existence of the street vendor is effort to restore the road function suitable with the allotment. The effort is done through arrangement activities of the business location for street vendors. It impacts toword restructuring of the street vendors in urban area whose the allotment for public road are prohibited for street vendors business, the step is expected able to be realized a clean, order, safe urban area for the embodiment of urban beautifulness and traffic smoothness. Of course the restructuring of street vendor business that is suitable with the law and orders, so able to prevent and alleviate the negative impact from the street vendors' existence. The location arrangement for the street vendors should be done so the street vendors' existence to do their business will not disturb the public interest.

However the policy implementation of the street vendors' arrangement at the Makassar city in the real practice of these regulations which streets are prohibited for street vendors still crowded filled by the street vendors of the Makassar city. The policy to regulate the street vendors of Makassar city that impact to the street vendors' restructuring which held by Satpol PP of Makassar City (government institution that responsible for enforcing the local regulation of Makassar city) do not influence to the street vendors that always occupy the road body or public spaces that are prohibited for them, that is caused by the street vendors reluctant to leave the prohibited places or streets. The policy of street vendors' arrangement that impact to the restructuring of street vendors at the Makassar city often get resistance from the street vendors and sometimes the restructure ended with the physical quarrel between the street vendors with the Satpol PP of Makassar city. The street vendors often back to the prohibited places and streets so it becomes recurring pattern without solution for the street vendors' existence. It caused complex and peculiar problem to be solved soon by the Makassar city government recall to the regulation for the street vendors should be done because the many problems from the many and chaotic street vendors without override their positive role from the existence of the street vendors.

2. Research Methods

The research used descriptive qualitative method with research focus refers to the research problems and goals. The data collection was done by interview, observation and documentation. While in the data analysis by using interactive model from Miles and Huberman, namely data collection, data reduction, data display and conclusion drawing are also use in this project [2].

3. Street Vendors and Determinants to Policy Implementation

According to Bromley (2000) "Street vendors are an integral component of urban economies around the world. Distributors of affordable goods and services, they provide consumers with convenient and accessible retail options and form a vital part of the social and economic life of a city. Street vending as an occupation has existed for hundreds of years and is considered a cornerstone of many cities' historical and cultural heritage". [3]

International Labour Organization (2000) "The academic literature on street vending commonly treats street vendors broadly as those who sell goods or services in public space. This includes the full gamut of goods and services, traded on a wholesale or retail basis, in streets and other kinds of related public spaces – including sidewalks, alleyways, and medians. Street vendors may have fixed stalls such as kiosks, semi-fixed stalls like folding tables; they may operate from crates, collapsible stands, or wheeled pushcarts that are moved and stored overnight. Other vendors sell from fixed locations without a stall structure, displaying their merchandise on cloth/plastic sheets; mobile vendors walk or bicycle through the streets as they sell". [4]

Anderson (1987; 25) argues; "policy implementation is the application of the policy by the government's administrative machinery to the problem"[5]. Edward III (1980:1) argues; "policy implementation …is the stage of policy making between the establishment of a policy …and the consequences of the policy for the people whom it affects" [6]. While Grindle (1980, h. 6) argued that; "implementation – a general process of administrative action that can be investigated at specifics program level" [7].

Lester and Stewart (2000; 105) implementation policy may be understood as a process, an output, and an outcome. It also involves a number of actors, organizations, and techniques of control. [8].

The success of policy implementations, as stated in the work of Ripley and Franklin (1986:232), should be measured by the degree of compliance, smoothly functioning routines and the absence of problems, as well as the desired performance and impacts. [9]

According to George C. Edwards III (1980;2), there are four critical factors to policy implementation. Namely: communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. Communication encompasses transmission, clarity, and consistency. Resources consist of human resource, information, authority, and facilities. Disposition is related to the character of the policy implementor. Therefore, it needs strong motivation for the success. While, bureaucratic structure refers to standard operating procedures and fragmentations. [6].

Mazmanian and Sabatier (1983; 21) argues that preceded implementation of the identification of variables that influence the achievement of policy objectives in the overall implementation process. These variables were categorized into three major parts, namely: (1) tractability of the problem (the problem difficulty level), (2) the ability to structure the implementation process (the implementation process of structuring capabilities), and (3) the non-statutory variables affecting implementation (non-government policy variables) the third variable is positioned as an independent variable that affects the stages of implementation. Meanwhile, every

stage of implementation affects the next stage. The stages in the implementation process according to Mazmanian and Sabatier starts from the translation of policy objectives. This may be a translation of the derivation policy, standard operating procedures, and programs of implementing agencies (implementors). This process usually requires certain efforts to prepare the technical analysis of how the application works on a more concrete situation. The impact of the implementation process if the implementation process is the final result. [10].

4. Findings and Discussion

The Makassar city government has issued Local Regulation No 10 year 1990 on Development of Street Vendor at the Makassar city, where in the local regulation also regulate about the business location and the City government of Makassar has issued some Mayor Regulations that related with the street vendors' arrangement where it is stated there is prohibition at some road to the street vendors to do their business. While the regulation is Mayor Regulation No 44 Year 2002 on Designation of Some Yards For and Not For Street Vendors at the Makassar city and the Mayor Decree No 651 Year 2007 on Rectangle Area of Road as the Pilot Project of Cleanliness and Regulation Enforcement of Makassar City.

The policy of Makassar city in regulate the existence of the street vendor is effort to restore the road function suitable with the allotment. The effort is done through arrangement activities of the business location for street vendors. It impacts toword restructuring of the street vendors in urban area whose the allotment for public road are prohibited for street vendors business, the step is expected able to be realized a clean, order, safe urban area for the embodiment of urban beautifulness and traffic smoothness. Of course the restructuring of street vendor business that is suitable with the law and orders, so able to prevent and alleviate the negative impact from the street vendors' existence. The location arrangement for the street vendors should be done so the street vendors' existence to do their business will not disturb the public interest.

Below is some problems relate with the street vendor at the Makassar city:

The *existing policy: the inability in structuring the implementation process appropriately*.

With the various regulations relate with the street vendors arrangement at the Makassar city unable to give solution to the existing problems because the substance or the content of the policy. Beside that at the implementation level, the restructuring of street vendors at the Makassar city unable to structure the implementation process appropriately because the policy that seem contradictive as that occur at the Local Regulation No. 10 Year 1990 on the Development of Street Vendors of The Makassar City with Mayor Regulation No 20 Year 2004 on Fixed Procedure of Restructuring Building and Street Vendors Development at The Makassar City where in the Local Regulation No. 10 Year 1990 on the Development of Street Vendor of Makassar City, stated that the street vendors are prohibited to do business at the street body, sidewalks and other public spaces. With other words, the Satpol PP has rights to restructure the street vendors that violate the Local Regulation No. 10 Year 1990 on the prohibition of street vendors that occupy the street body at the Makassar city but in the Mayor regulation No. 20 Year 2004 on Fixed Procedure of Building Control and Street Vendors Development of Makassar city, stated that the Head district authorities to responsible fully for the development of street vendors in each their work area, with other words the Head district that responsible for the street vendors activities so the Satpol PP sometimes should wait for the Head district's instruction to take action against the street vendors who unobedient toword Local Regulation. The district government seem allows the street vendors with the no clarity about the tolerated streets for the street vendors in doing their business so produce inconsistence between the goal of district government with the Satpol PP of Makassar city.

And the lack synergy and coordination by Satpol PP and the district government and sub district government make the control to the street vendors at the Makassar city do not run well.

The *lack solution to the street vendors' existence: insufficient relocation*

The existing policy solution right now such as street vendors' relocation at the Laguna area is considered as unable to contain the many street vendors of the Makassar city and added with the problems of relocation place management that is less well so many street vendors do not want to occupy their location again.

The limited relocation and relocation that is considered as not gainfully for the street vendors cause the street vendors back to occupy the prohibited streets. It indicates that the relocation policy is limited and not gainfully for the street vendors causes the resistance of the street vendors so sometimes there is physical contact between the street vendors with the Satpol PP of Makassar city.

It should be known that, the existence of street vendors come from the problems of the inability of the city government to provide proper job for the society so it should be considered the solution causality to the existing problems where the handling of street vendors' problems should be adjusted with the underlying problems.

Based on obtained data from the Chairman of Street Vendor Association of South Sulawesi (APKLI SULSEL), named Sugeng Imam Santoso, he stated "most street vendors only graduated from elementary school, but 2% are bachelor degree.The citizen who choose the job of street vendors 76.39% because of no other job. 6.40% because of low capital, 2.36% because as the victim of combed out, 7.10% continue the family business, and 4.99% with other reasons". [11].

The data is clear that the most reasons for the job of street vendors is because the difficulty to find other jobs, the others because of low capital, combed out, and etc. The matters that make the community choose the job.

Street vendors always occupy the street body that is prohibited by city government because no solution about their fate and their job continuity. Because the street vendors' problem come from the failure of the government to provide work opportunity or solution to them, such as proper relocation area.

Limited place or area for relocation caused them difficult to not violate because the street vendors do not have other choice beside occupy the street body that is prohibited by the Makassar city government. The street vendors are not wary to back to occupy the prohibited streets although have been restructured many times.

The relocation policy for the street vendors at the Makassar city to overcome the chaotic street vendors at the city. The provisioning and managing of the relocation place for the street vendors should be done immediately of course with the proper place for relocation so the location can be accessed by society in general. Beside that, the city government should consider the control and management of the relocation area to make it convenient and proper to be occupied by the street vendors.

5. Conclusions

The scarcity of reliable sites for the relocation of street vendors in Makassar City is a prominent factor causing the difficulty for the management of street vendors in Makassar City. Many street vendors have occupied the public road which has been warned against by the Government of Makassar City as the response of street vendors to the lack of relocation sites provided by the Government of Makassar City. The stubborn street vendors always come back to the forbidden road despite the exclusion. It seems that street vendors do not have other choice but selling in the public road and occupying pedestrian pavement and street bank, and it put them always as the deviator of local regulation.

The obstacles in the implementation of street vendors' arrangement at the Makassar city do not run well as expected. The existing policy unable to disentangle the street vendors' problem because the substance of the existing policy less relevant with the complexity of street vendors' problem. Of course it is needed the policy that able to give comprehensive solution to the street vendors problems especially the solution to the street vendors existence at the Makassar city.

6. Recommendations

a. The policies related to the restructuring and fostering of street vendors in Makassar City must be made in consistent to the recent development when street vendors can be a more complex issue.

b. The policies related to the provision of reliable relocation site for street vendors are important to prevent street vendors from occupying public road or place forbidden by the Government of Makassar City, because it helps the Government of Makassar City to restructure street vendors in order to reduce problems causing by them against road traffic, urban scenery and orderliness.

c. Some places or parts of the road may be tolerated for street vendors who sell their goods on the sidewalk to avoid from disturbing traffic, and the restructuring is still implemented to eliminate the issues of cleanliness and orderliness of the city.

REFERENCES

[1] Anonymous, (2013) PKL di Makassar mencapai 14 ribu (online). Avalaible: http://www.kabarmakassar.com/hukum-kriminal/item/10101-pkl-di-makassar-mencapai-14-ribu.html. (Accessed December 18th 2013).

[2] Miles. Mattew. B. and Michael A. Huberman, Analisis data Kuantitatif, Universitas Indonesia Pres, Jakarta. 1992.

[3] Bromley, Ray, "Street Vending and Public Policy: Global Revies". International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy. (Vol. 20). 2000.

[4] International Labour Organization (ILO), "Women and Men in The Informal Economy", International Labour Organization, 2002.

[5] Anderson James, E., Public Policy Making, Holt Renerhart and Wiston. 1979.

[6] Edwards III, George C., Implementing Public Policy, Congressional Quarterly Press, Washington, 1990.

[7] Grindle, Merilee. Politics and Policy Implementation In The Third World. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press. 1980.

[8] Lester, James, P. and Joseph Stewart. Public Policy: An Evolutionary Approach. Second Edition. Australia, Wadsworth. 2000.

[9] Repley, Randall B. And Franklin, Grace A., Policy Implementation and Bureaucracy, dorsey Press, Chicago, 1986.

[10] Mazmanian D. and Sebatier. P. Implementation and Public Policy. HarperCollins Publisher, New York. 1983.

[11] Anonymous, (2013) Pemkot tak serius bina PKL (online). Avalaible: http://koran-sindo.com/node/342141pemkot tak serius bina PKL.html (Accessed 18 Desember 2013).